



SDMS DocID

2142832

DRAFT AGENDA
USEPA Region 3 / Cabot Oil & Gas Corporation
Dimock Water Sampling Meeting
USEPA Region 3 Offices
February 22, 2011
TBD

PFE ORIGINAL

I.

II.

III.

IV.

Ex. 5 - Deliberative

Meeting with Cabot at USEPA

2/22/2012

Humane Zia, Amy	USEPA	215 814 3454
John Smetko	Cabot	412-249-3854
STEVEN LINDEMAN	CABOT	281-589-4880
BODDY WYLIE	CABOT	412-249-3930
James Piatra Jr	URS Corp.	412-503-4602
Lowell Rothschild	Bracewell & Giuliani	202-828-5817
Jason Hutt	Bracewell & Giuliani	202-828-5850
Amy Barrette	Fulbright & Jaworski	724-914-0014
Kevin Cunningham	Cabot Oil + Gas	281-589-5735
Kimberly Brown-Penny	USEPA	215-814-5404
DAVID RYAN	USEPA	215-814-2916
Dennis P. Carey	EPA-Region III	(215) 814-3241
John Gilbert	USEPA	513/607-157
Karen Johnson	USEPA	215-814-5445
Jennifer Saxe	USEPA	215 814 5806
Richard M. Felzer	USEPA	570 402 7108
Richard Rupert	USEPA	215 814 3463
Victoria P. Binetti	USEPA	215-814-5757
Kathy Hodgkiss	USEPA	215/814-3151
Shawn M. Garvin	USEPA	215-814-2900
Carl Borsellino	USEPA	215-814-3170
Jon Capacasa	USEPA	215-814-5422
Cecil Rodrigues	USEPA	215-814-2683
Heather Gray	USEPA	215-814-2696



FYI - DEP attendees for Cabot meeting

Ron Borsellino, Jon Capacasa, Humane Zia,
Jennie Saxe to: Cecil Rodrigues, Gray Heather, Victoria Binetti,
KarenD Johnson, Kathy Hodgkiss, Dennis

02/21/2012 11:00 AM

Oil and Gas: Scott Perry ✓

External Affairs: Alisa Harris ✓

Field Operations/Program Integration: Dana Aunkst, Marcus Kohl ✓

Water: Kelly Heffner, Lisa Daniels ✓

Counsel: David Raphael, Donna Duffy ✓

Environmental Cleanup: George Hartenstein, Eric Supey ✓

WAF/115

Eric - ?

Jennie Perey Saxe, Ph.D.
State/Congressional Liaison - Pennsylvania
U.S. EPA Region III
1650 Arch Street
Philadelphia, PA 19103
215-814-5806
saxe.jennie@epa.gov

The agenda items from Cabot's email dated February 2, 2012 are:

- I. Introductions
- II. Technical Briefing / Cabot Overview of Dimock Sampling Data
- III. Update on Status of Response to EPA's Request for Information
- IV. EPA Update on Well Sampling and Next Steps
(They do not expect a discussion about EPA sampling results but would like to know our expected timing for providing results.)

We are meeting with you today at your request to hear your position from a technical perspective on what is going on with groundwater and drinking water wells in Dimock. We are interested in hearing what your data and information are telling you about the groundwater in the Dimock area as it may help us to determine our next steps.

Excerpts from recent correspondence:

Our actions in Dimock have been guided by science.

We are in Dimock in response to requests from community members who are concerned about potential risks to their health as a result of Cabot Oil and Gas Corporation's decision to stop providing alternate water supplies. We intervened when we became aware of monitoring data, developed largely by Cabot, indicating the presence of several hazardous substances in drinking water samples, including some at levels of health concern. Because the data available was incomplete and of uncertain quality, we determined that additional monitoring was prudent to investigate potential health concerns and develop a sound scientific basis for assessing the need for further action to protect public health.

EPA received additional data from some residents, including the results of monitoring by Cabot that warranted a further evaluation of the situation. Review of this data, together with changes in some EPA screening levels for assessing risk, led us to the conclusion that there were health concerns that required action. In addition, although arsenic, manganese, and sodium are naturally occurring in the environment as you mention, EPA carefully reviewed the levels of these chemicals detected in home wells and found them inconsistent with background concentrations typically found in the aquifer zones from which Dimock home owners draw their well water.

We took the limited step of providing alternate water to four homes where hazardous substances were present at levels above health-based thresholds to provide interim protection to residents while monitoring is underway. We asked Cabot if they were willing to deliver water to these four homes and took action only after Cabot declined.

KATHY T
2/11/12

Our actions reflect our longstanding responsibility under federal environmental laws to address threats to public health. Since the signing of the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act (CERCLA) statute in 1980, EPA has responded to hundreds of sites across the country to provide alternate water and conduct sampling when the presence of hazardous substances posed a potential risk to potable water.

State and federal agencies have critical, complementary roles in ensuring that shale gas extraction occurs safely. States have important front-line responsibilities in permitting natural gas extraction, and we respect and support their efforts. But EPA, likewise, has important oversight responsibilities and acts as a critical backstop when public health or the environment may be at risk. We intend to exercise this authority prudently and sparingly. Again, we would consider action in any situation where we are presented with information showing potential health risks to citizens within the scope of the laws we administer, regardless of the context or background of the site.

EPA is taking every precaution to ensure that our samples are collected and reviewed using the highest scientific standards. The residents in Dimock deserve answers based on the facts, and we look forward to working together with residents, PADEP and Cabot to meet our responsibility to your community.

1/19/2012 Press Release

PHILADELPHIA (Jan. 19, 2012) – The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency announced today that it plans to perform water sampling at approximately 60 homes in the Carter Road/Meshoppen Creek Road area of Dimock, Pa. to further assess whether any residents are being exposed to hazardous substances that cause health concerns. EPA's decision to conduct sampling is based on EPA's review of data provided by residents, Cabot Oil and Gas, and the Pennsylvania Department of Environmental Protection.

"EPA is working diligently to understand the situation in Dimock and address residents' concerns," said EPA Regional Administrator Shawn M. Garvin. "We believe that the information provided to us by the residents deserves further review, and conducting our own sampling will help us fill information gaps. Our actions will be based on the science and the law and we will work to help get a more complete picture of water quality for these homes in Dimock."

The sampling will begin in a matter of days and the agency estimates that it will take at least three weeks to sample all the homes. All sampling is contingent on access granted to the property. EPA expects validated results from quality-tested lab to be available in about five weeks after samples are taken.

In addition, EPA is taking action to ensure delivery of temporary water supplies to four homes where data reviewed by EPA indicates that residents' well water contains levels of contaminants that pose a health concern. EPA will reevaluate this decision when it completes sampling of the wells at these four homes. Current information on other wells does not support the need for alternative water at this time. However, the information does support the need for further sampling.

Natural gas plays a key role in our nation's clean energy future and the Obama Administration is committed to ensuring that the development of this vital resource occurs safely and responsibly. At

the direction of Congress, and separate from this limited sampling, EPA has begun a national study on the potential impacts of hydraulic fracturing on drinking water resources.

Statement we sent to a reporter on Jan. 19

We believe further data is needed to get a more complete picture of the water quality situation in these homes. EPA will conduct its own sampling at 61 homes. Our actions will be based on the science and the law and we will work to help get a more complete picture of water quality for these homes in Dimock. EPA has also reached out to the state Department of Environmental Protection and Cabot Oil and Gas Corp to offer them the opportunity to join EPA in the sampling.

Statement finalized on Jan. 26 in response to Cabot Allegations

EPA is in this community sampling and providing water as a direct result of requests from Dimock residents. Our priority is the health of the people there, and our actions are guided entirely by science and the law. We are providing water to a handful of households because data developed by Cabot itself provides evidence that they are being exposed to hazardous substances at levels of health concern. We are conducting monitoring as a prudent step to investigate these concerns and develop a sound scientific basis for assessing the need for further action. This is consistent with steps we would take in any situation where we are presented with potential health risks to citizens under the federal laws we are charged to carry out.

In his State of the Union address, President Obama made clear that he is committed to tapping America's natural gas as part of a new era in American energy. He also affirmed our commitment to "developing this resource without putting the health and safety of our citizens at risk."

We have been clear that if we see an immediate threat to public health, we will not hesitate to take steps under the law to protect Americans whose health may be at risk. The Agency also welcomes PADEP and Cabot's participation in the sampling. Without a doubt, EPA's samples will be collected and reviewed using the highest scientific standards and we will take into account all other relevant and reliable data developed by PADEP and Cabot. The residents in Dimock deserve answers based on the facts, and we look forward to working together to meet our responsibility to this community.

The agenda items from Cabot's email dated February 2, 2012 are:

- I. Introductions
- II. Technical Briefing / Cabot Overview of Dimock Sampling Data
- III. Update on Status of Response to EPA's Request for Information
- IV. EPA Update on Well Sampling and Next Steps
(They do not expect a discussion about EPA sampling results but would like to know our expected timing for providing results.)

We are meeting with you today at your request to hear your position from a technical perspective on what is going on with groundwater and drinking water wells in Dimock. We are interested in hearing what your data and information are telling you about the groundwater in the Dimock area as it may help us to determine our next steps.

Excerpts from recent correspondence:

Our actions in Dimock have been guided by science.

We are in Dimock in response to requests from community members who are concerned about potential risks to their health as a result of Cabot Oil and Gas Corporation's decision to stop providing alternate water supplies. We intervened when we became aware of monitoring data, developed largely by Cabot, indicating the presence of several hazardous substances in drinking water samples, including some at levels of health concern. Because the data available was incomplete and of uncertain quality, we determined that additional monitoring was prudent to investigate potential health concerns and develop a sound scientific basis for assessing the need for further action to protect public health.

EPA received additional data from some residents, including the results of monitoring by Cabot that warranted a further evaluation of the situation. Review of this data, together with changes in some EPA screening levels for assessing risk, led us to the conclusion that there were health concerns that required action. In addition, although arsenic, manganese, and sodium are naturally occurring in the environment as you mention, EPA carefully reviewed the levels of these chemicals detected in home wells and found them inconsistent with background concentrations typically found in the aquifer zones from which Dimock home owners draw their well water.

We took the limited step of providing alternate water to four homes where hazardous substances were present at levels above health-based thresholds to provide interim protection to residents while monitoring is underway. We asked Cabot if they were willing to deliver water to these four homes and took action only after Cabot declined.

Our actions reflect our longstanding responsibility under federal environmental laws to address threats to public health. Since the signing of the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act (CERCLA) statute in 1980, EPA has responded to hundreds of sites across the country to provide alternate water and conduct sampling when the presence of hazardous substances posed a potential risk to potable water.

State and federal agencies have critical, complementary roles in ensuring that shale gas extraction occurs safely. States have important front-line responsibilities in permitting natural gas extraction, and we respect and support their efforts. But EPA, likewise, has important oversight responsibilities and acts as a critical backstop when public health or the environment may be at risk. We intend to exercise this authority prudently and sparingly. Again, we would consider action in any situation where we are presented with information showing potential health risks to citizens within the scope of the laws we administer, regardless of the context or background of the site.

EPA is taking every precaution to ensure that our samples are collected and reviewed using the highest scientific standards. The residents in Dimock deserve answers based on the facts, and we look forward to working together with residents, PADEP and Cabot to meet our responsibility to your community.

1/19/2012 Press Release

PHILADELPHIA (Jan. 19, 2012) – The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency announced today that it plans to perform water sampling at approximately 60 homes in the Carter Road/Meshoppen Creek Road area of Dimock, Pa. to further assess whether any residents are being exposed to hazardous substances that cause health concerns. EPA's decision to conduct sampling is based on EPA's review of data provided by residents, Cabot Oil and Gas, and the Pennsylvania Department of Environmental Protection.

"EPA is working diligently to understand the situation in Dimock and address residents' concerns," said EPA Regional Administrator Shawn M. Garvin. "We believe that the information provided to us by the residents deserves further review, and conducting our own sampling will help us fill information gaps. Our actions will be based on the science and the law and we will work to help get a more complete picture of water quality for these homes in Dimock."

The sampling will begin in a matter of days and the agency estimates that it will take at least three weeks to sample all the homes. All sampling is contingent on access granted to the property. EPA expects validated results from quality-tested lab to be available in about five weeks after samples are taken.

In addition, EPA is taking action to ensure delivery of temporary water supplies to four homes where data reviewed by EPA indicates that residents' well water contains levels of contaminants that pose a health concern. EPA will reevaluate this decision when it completes sampling of the wells at these four homes. Current information on other wells does not support the need for alternative water at this time. However, the information does support the need for further sampling.

Natural gas plays a key role in our nation's clean energy future and the Obama Administration is committed to ensuring that the development of this vital resource occurs safely and responsibly. At

the direction of Congress, and separate from this limited sampling, EPA has begun a national study on the potential impacts of hydraulic fracturing on drinking water resources.

Statement we sent to a reporter on Jan. 19

We believe further data is needed to get a more complete picture of the water quality situation in these homes. EPA will conduct its own sampling at 61 homes. Our actions will be based on the science and the law and we will work to help get a more complete picture of water quality for these homes in Dimock. EPA has also reached out to the state Department of Environmental Protection and Cabot Oil and Gas Corp to offer them the opportunity to join EPA in the sampling.

Statement finalized on Jan. 26 in response to Cabot Allegations

EPA is in this community sampling and providing water as a direct result of requests from Dimock residents. Our priority is the health of the people there, and our actions are guided entirely by science and the law. We are providing water to a handful of households because data developed by Cabot itself provides evidence that they are being exposed to hazardous substances at levels of health concern. We are conducting monitoring as a prudent step to investigate these concerns and develop a sound scientific basis for assessing the need for further action. This is consistent with steps we would take in any situation where we are presented with potential health risks to citizens under the federal laws we are charged to carry out.

In his State of the Union address, President Obama made clear that he is committed to tapping America's natural gas as part of a new era in American energy. He also affirmed our commitment to "developing this resource without putting the health and safety of our citizens at risk."

We have been clear that if we see an immediate threat to public health, we will not hesitate to take steps under the law to protect Americans whose health may be at risk. The Agency also welcomes PADEP and Cabot's participation in the sampling. Without a doubt, EPA's samples will be collected and reviewed using the highest scientific standards and we will take into account all other relevant and reliable data developed by PADEP and Cabot. The residents in Dimock deserve answers based on the facts, and we look forward to working together to meet our responsibility to this community.

Ex. 5 - Deliberative

Ex. 5 - Deliberative

Ex. 5 - Deliberative